Confirmation of the exotic Z(4430)⁻ resonance at LHCb

Greig Cowan (Edinburgh) Edinburgh, 16th May 2014





Overview

- 1. Exotic spectroscopy: motivation
- 2. Introduction to the LHCb experiment
- 3. Reminder of Dalitz plots and amplitude analyses
- 4. The Z(4430)⁻
 - History
 - Searching for the Z(4430)⁻ in B⁰ $\rightarrow \psi$ (2S)K⁺ π ⁻ decays
 - Determining the quantum numbers (J^P)
- 5. Other exotic spectroscopy results
 - X(3872)
 - The scalar mesons, $f_0(500)$ and $f_0(980)$

Will give some technical details to explain plots like this



arXiv:1404.1903 accepted by PRL

"Three quarks for Muster Mark!"

- Bound states of quarks to form mesons and baryons were first proposed in 1964 by Gell-Mann and Zweig.
- **qqqqq** states are not *a priori* excluded.
- Light quark spectroscopy used to understand structure of these states.
 - Difficult due to wide overlapping states, background.
 - Highly relativistic constituents (u, d and s quarks).
- What about heavier quarks?







Charmonium spectroscopy (cc̄)

- Simpler system to analyse since c quark is heavier
 - non-relativistic calculations
 - potential models
 - lattice QCD
 - narrow, non-overlapping states below DD threshold
 - no mixing of cc with lighter qq states.

Classify using J ^{PC}
J=L+S
$P = (-1)^{L+1}$
$C = (-1)^{L+S}$



Olsen arXiv:1403.1254

Exotic charmonium spectroscopy

- Many different exotic (XYZ) states have been seen.
 - BESIII, Belle/BaBar, CDF/D0
 - mass/width, decay, J^{PC}
- Are these [qq][q
 q
 q] (tetraquarks), mesonic molecules, threshold effects, hybrids...?
- No clear pattern: need experimental and theoretical study to understand strong interaction dynamics that can cause their production and structure.





Thresholds

Godfrey, Olsen, Ann.Rev.Nucl.Part.Sci.58:51-73,2008

The LHCb experiment

- Rare B decays
- CP violation
- Charm physics
- (Exotic) spectroscopy
- QCD and electroweak

~900 physicists from 64 universities/labs in 16 countries.
Running since 2010, >180 papers published.
O(100k) bb pairs produced/sec.

LHC

The LHCb detector



A typical LHCb event



Luminosity



- LHCb designed to run at lower luminosity than ATLAS/CMS.
 - LHCb tracking is sensitive to pile-up.
- LHC pp beams are displaced to reduce instantaneous luminosity.
 - Stable running conditions.

 $\langle L \rangle_{2011} = 2.7 \times 10^{32} \text{ Hz/cm}^2$ $\langle L \rangle_{2012} = 4.0 \times 10^{32} \text{ Hz/cm}^2$

History of the Z(4430)⁻

- Belle observed Z(4430)⁻ from sample of ~2k B⁰ $\rightarrow \psi$ (2S)K^{+,0}π⁻
- Charged state ⇒ minimal quark content of ccud

$$P^{+}\mu^{-}, J/\Psi\pi^{+}\pi^{-}$$

$$B^{0} \rightarrow \psi(2S)K^{+,0}\pi^{-}$$

$$B^{0} \rightarrow Z(4430)^{-}K^{+,0} \qquad \mu^{+}\mu^{-}, J/\Psi\pi^{+}\pi^{-}$$

$$\psi(2S)\pi^{-}$$



History of the Z(4430)⁻



Reminder about Dalitz plots - 3 body decay



$$d\Gamma = rac{1}{(2\pi)^3} rac{1}{32M^3} \,\overline{|\mathcal{M}|^2} \, dm_{12}^2 \, dm_{23}^2$$

- Configuration of decay depends on ang. mom. of decay products.
- All dynamical information contained in $|\mathcal{M}|^2$.
- Density plot of m_{12}^2 vs. m_{23}^2 to infer information on $|\mathcal{M}|^2$.

Constraints	Degrees of freedom		
3 four-vectors	+12		
All decay in same plane (p	-3		
E	-3		
Energy + momentum conservation	-3		
Rotate system in plane	-1		
Total	+2		



Reminder about Dalitz plots $d\Gamma = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{32M^3} \overline{|\mathcal{M}|^2} dm_{12}^2 dm_{23}^2$

Spin-1 resonance



Breit-Wigner amplitude

- Often model resonances with mass (m_0) , width (Γ_0) using a relativistic Breit-Wigner function.
- q is daughter particle momentum in rest frame of resonance.
- B₁ are Blatt-Weisskopf functions for the orbital angular momentum (L) barrier factors.

$$BW(m|m_0, \Gamma_0) = \frac{1}{m_0^2 - m^2 - im_0\Gamma(m)}$$

R→ab

$$\Gamma(m) = \Gamma_0 \left(\frac{q}{q_0}\right)^{2L_{K^*}+1} \frac{m_0}{m} B'_{L_{K^*}}(q, q_0, d)^2$$





Reminder about Dalitz plots $d\Gamma = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{32M^3} \overline{|\mathcal{M}|^2} dm_{12}^2 dm_{23}^2$



Confirmation of the Z(4430)⁻

arXiv:1404.1903 accepted by PRL

 $\psi(2S) \rightarrow \mu^{+}\mu^{-}$

- LHCb has sample of >25k $B^0 \rightarrow \psi(2S)K^{\dagger}\pi^{-}$ candidates.
 - Factor 10 more than Belle/BaBar.
- Selection: most events come through dimuon trigger (eff~90%)
- Typical B pT ~6GeV, µ pT ~ 2GeV, K pT ~1GeV
- Use sidebands to build 4D model of combinatorial background.
 - Backgrounds from mis-ID physics decays is small excellent LHCb PID!



4D Dalitz plot (scalar \rightarrow vector scalar scalar)



- $B^0 \rightarrow \psi(2S)K^+\pi^-, \quad \psi(2S) \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$
- Need to use the angular information, in addition to $m(\psi(2S)\pi^{-})^2 vs m(K^{+}\pi^{-})^2$, to understand $|\mathcal{M}|^2$.





Amplitude model

dimuon helicity amplitudes are

incoherent (cannot interfere)

 10^{4} 10³ amplitude [arbitrary units] • Use the Isobar approach, build 10² amplitude from sum of 10^{1} overlapping and interfering Breit- 10^{0} 10⁻¹ Wigner resonances. 10⁻² 10⁻³ 10⁻⁴ 10⁻⁵ Sum over the k resonances 0.8 1.0 1.2 1.4 1.6 1.8 m [GeV] $\sum_{\Delta\lambda_{\mu}=-1,1} \left| \sum_{\lambda_{\psi}=-1,0,1} \sum_{k} A_{k,\lambda_{\psi}}(m_{K\pi},\Omega|m_{0\,k},\Gamma_{0\,k}) \right|$ $|\mathcal{M}|^2$ Complex amplitude that In 4D fit, $\mu^+\mu^-$ are final state encodes the mass and Now different ψ helicity particles: thus different

amplitudes interfere

10⁵

angular dependence

Amplitude model - adding in the Z(4430)

- Candidates / (2.38e-02 Adding the Z(4430) component is a bit more difficult since it has different helicity frame compared to $K^+\pi^-$ resonances.
- It is has a BW shape in $m_{\Psi(2S)\pi^-}$ mass, but is basically flat in $m_{K^+\pi^-}$.
- Low Q-value in decay, so ignore D-wave contribution $\Rightarrow A_{Z,-1} = A_{Z,0} = A_{Z,+1}$



$$|\mathcal{M}|^{2} = \sum_{\Delta\lambda_{\mu}=-1,1} \left| \sum_{\lambda_{\psi}=-1,0,1} \sum_{k} A_{k,\lambda_{\psi}}(m_{K\pi}, \Omega | m_{0\,k}, \Gamma_{0\,k}) \right|^{2}$$

$$\begin{array}{c} + \sum_{\substack{\lambda Z \\ \psi} = -1, 0, 1} A_{Z, \lambda Z \\ \psi}(m_{\psi \pi}, \Omega^{Z} | m_{0 Z}, \Gamma_{0 Z}) e^{i \Delta \lambda_{\mu} \alpha} \\ \\ \text{Rotation by } \alpha \text{ to} \\ \\ \text{different helicity frame} \end{array}$$

Which resonances should we add?

From PDG



- $K^+\pi^-$ spectrum contains many overlapping resonances.
 - Each resonance has a complex amplitude for **each** helicity component, this impacts the $m_{\Psi(2S)\pi^{-}}$ distribution.
 - Measure all amplitudes relative to K*(892) helicity-0 component.
- Nominal result includes all resonances up to $K^*_1(1680)$.
- Main source of **systematic uncertainties** comes from varying model to include higher $K^{\dagger}\pi^{-}$ spin-states.

Background from sidebands of B mass

S-wave parameterisation

- Z(4430) has largest effect ~1.5GeV
- Important to understand
 Kπ S-wave in this region
- Isobar model is default
 - BW amplitude for K*(1430)+K₀(800)
 - Non-resonant contribution
- LASS model as cross-check
 - Does not violate unitarity
 - Sum of elastic scattering, destructively interfering with K*(1430).

Slowly varying NR contribution

$$\frac{1}{\cot \delta_B(m_{K\pi}) - i} + e^{2i\delta_B(m_{K\pi})} \frac{1}{\cot \delta_R(m_{K\pi}) - i}$$

$$\cot \delta_B(m_{K\pi}) = \frac{1}{a \, q} + \frac{1}{2} r \, q \qquad \cot \delta_R(m_{K\pi}) = \frac{m_0^2 - m_{K\pi}^2}{m_0 \Gamma(m_{K\pi})}$$





BW amplitude

for K(1430)

Reconstruction and selection efficiency

- Unfortunately, LHCb is not 100% efficient at reconstructing the decay particles in 4D space.
- Extract efficiency model from events simulated uniformly in phase space and passed through detector reconstruction.
- Also, remove events near edge of Dalitz boundary since efficiency not well modelled there.
- 2D representation...



Fitting the model to the data

• Likelihood fit to measure ~50 free parameters: amplitudes, phases, resonance mass/widths.

$$\begin{array}{c} \text{Observables (mass, angles)} \\ \text{PDF} & \text{Parameters} \\ N_{\text{data}} \\ N_{\text{data}} \\ \text{In } P_{\text{tot}}^{u}(\vec{v}_{i}|\vec{\omega}) = -\sum_{i}^{N_{\text{data}}} \ln\left(|\mathcal{M}(\vec{v}_{i}|\vec{\omega})|^{2} \epsilon(\vec{v}_{i})/I(\vec{\omega})\right) \end{array}$$

- In any amplitude fit, difficulty comes from **integrating** the matrix element.
- Solution: sum over fully simulated, reconstructed phase space MC.
 - This automatically includes the efficiency in the calculation.
 - Alternative approach that explicitly parameterises the 4D efficiency.

Try different models for $K^+\pi^-$ and Z(4430), compare values of \mathcal{L} .

 $N_{\rm MC}$

 $I(\vec{\omega}) = \sum |\mathcal{M}(\vec{v}_i | \vec{\omega})|^2$

Projections of 4D amplitude fit



Projections of 4D amplitude fit



Fit projections in slices of $\,m_{K^+\pi^-}$



arXiv:1404.1903

Spin determination and resonant behaviour



Systematics: second exotic Z?

- Investigated the possibility of a second exotic component.
- Fit confidence level increases to 26%.
- Need larger samples to characterise this state.





- Many checks performed to determine stability of the result and evaluate systematic errors on m_z, Γ_z, f_z.
- Main systematics come from assumption on $K^+\pi^-$ Isobar model, efficiency and $(q/m_{K^+\pi^-})^L$ vs. q^L

Model independent analysis



 $Y_2^0 = \sqrt{\frac{5}{4\pi}} \left(\frac{3}{2}\cos^2\theta - \frac{1}{2}\right)$

 $Y_2^1 = -\sqrt{\frac{15}{8\pi}} \sin\theta\cos\theta \, e^{i\phi}$

 $Y_2^2 = \frac{1}{4} \sqrt{\frac{15}{2\pi}} \sin^2 \theta \, e^{2i\phi}$

- Weight phase space simulated events with the spherical harmonic moments of $\text{cos}\theta_{\text{K}}$
- Moments of K* resonances are unable to explain observed distribution.

A bit more context...

- This result confirms the existence of the Z(4430), measures J^P=1⁺ and, for the first time, demonstrates the **resonant behaviour**.
- P=+ rules out interpretation in terms of D
 ^{*}(2007)D^{*}₂(2460) molecule or threshold effect.
- Four quark bound state is a remaining explanation.



```
Rosner, Phys. Rev. D76 (2007) 114002
Bugg, J. Phys. G35 (2008) 075005
```

30

• Last year BESIII and Belle observed another **exotic charged** state.







A well known exotic meson: X(3872)

- Observed by many experiments, first by Belle (PRL 91 (2003) 262001 894 citations!)
- $B^+ \rightarrow X(3872)K^+$, $X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi \pi^+ \pi^-$
- Use well-known $\psi(2S)$ resonance to calibrate
- Measure $J^{PC} = 1^{++}$ favours exotic interpretation
- Could be some combination of ccuu quarks or DD* molecule



A well known exotic meson: X(3872)



An enigma... the X(4140)

 $B^{\pm/0} \to X K^{\pm/0} \quad X \to J/\psi \phi$

Experiment	Mass (MeV)	Width (MeV)	σ	Published?	Ref.
CDF	4143.0±2.9±1.2	11.7	3.8	Υ	Phys. Rev. Lett. 102 , 242002
CDF	4143.4	15.3	>5	Ν	Public Note 10244
D0	4159.0±4.3±6.6	19.9±12.6	3.1	Y	Phys. Rev. D 89 , 012004
CMS	4148.0±2.4±6.3	28	>5	Ν	arXiv:1309.6920
Belle	_	-	-	Υ	Phys. Rev. Lett. 104, 112004
LHCb	_	-	-	Υ	Phys. Rev. D 85, 091103(R)
BaBar	_	_	-	Ν	_



33

Light quark spectroscopy using $B^0 \rightarrow J/\Psi \pi^+ \pi^-$

- Study substructure of light mesons that decay to $\pi^+\pi^-$.
- Mass ordering is reversed between the scalar and vector mesons nonets.

Isospin	I = 0	I = 1/2	I = 0	I = 1
Scalar mesons	$f_0(500)$	$\kappa(800)$	$f_0(980)$	$a_0(980)$
Vector mesons	$\phi(1020)$	$K^{*}(892)^{0}$	$\omega(783)$	ho(776)

Stone, Zhang, PRL 111, 062001 (2013) Fleischer, Knegjens Eur.Phys.J. C71 (2011)

1832

34

PDG review on scalar mesons below 2GeV

• Are the scalar mesons (f₀(500), f₀(980)) $q\bar{q}$ or tetraquarks or some mixture?

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{Scalar meson} \\ \text{mixing} & |f_0(980)\rangle = \cos \varphi_m |s\overline{s}\rangle + \sin \varphi_m |n\overline{n}\rangle \\ & |f_0(500)\rangle = -\sin \varphi_m |s\overline{s}\rangle + \cos \varphi_m |n\overline{n}\rangle, \\ & \text{where } |n\overline{n}\rangle \equiv \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left(|u\overline{u}\rangle + |d\overline{d}\rangle \right). \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \overline{B}^{0} \left\{ \begin{smallmatrix} \mathbf{b} & \mathbf{c} \\ \overline{\mathbf{d}} & \mathbf{c} \\ \hline \mathbf{c} \\ \overline{\mathbf{d}} \\ \end{bmatrix}_{\pi^+}^{\mathbf{c}} & \tan^2 \varphi_m \equiv r_{\sigma}^{f} = \frac{\mathcal{B} \left(\overline{B}^{0} \to J/\psi \, f_0(980) \right)}{\mathcal{B} \left(\overline{B}^{0} \to J/\psi \, f_0(500) \right)} \frac{\Phi(500)}{\Phi(980)}, \quad = 1/2 \end{aligned}$$

Amplitude analysis of $B^0 \rightarrow J/\Psi \pi^+ \pi^-$

x

y

 $\overline{B}{}^{\scriptscriptstyle 0}$

 $\pi^+\pi^-$

 $\mu^+\mu^-$





- Build 4D matrix element from overlapping $\pi^+\pi^$ resonances.
- Correct for efficiency.
- No sign of exotic $J/\psi\pi^+$ resonances...



Amplitude analysis of $B^0 \rightarrow J/\Psi \pi^+ \pi^-$

 ρ - ω interference visible



- Best fit model shows does not require $f_0(980)$ component.
- Gives upper limit on the mixing angle between $f_0(500)$ and $f_0(980)$.

$$\tan^2 \varphi_m \equiv r_{\sigma}^f = (1.1^{+1.2+6.0}_{-0.7-0.7}) \times 10^{-2} < 0.098$$
 at 90% C.L

Different from tetraquark prediction (1/2) by 8σ

Summary

- LHCb has confirmed this existence and shown the **resonant** behaviour of the Z(4430)⁻.
- Minimal quark content of ccud.
- No clear picture of the complex system of charmonium-like exotic resonances.
- Z(4430)⁻ should help to improve understanding.
- Further constraints could come from observing this in other decay modes.
- Next steps...
 - LHCb has large datasets of B decays containing J/ Ψ , Ψ (2S), χ _{c...} where other exotics could live.
 - Data taking starts again in 2015, looking forward to collecting even higher statistics!



 $Z(4430)^{-}$ amplitude

expected for

a resonance

 $\operatorname{Im} A^{Z^{-}}$

-0.5

3.0

 $\eta_{c}(1^{1}S_{0})$

0-+

2++

🗕 data

- total fit

BACKUP

$Z_c(3900)$ in $e^+e^- \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^- J/\psi$

Other exotic **charged** state observed by BESIII and Belle

3.8

100

80

60

40

20

3.7

Events / 0.01 GeV/c²

 $M = (3894.5 \pm 6.6 \pm 4.5) MeV/c^2$ $\Gamma = (63 \pm 24 \pm 26) \text{ MeV/c}^2$

Other exotic states in quarkonium spectra

- Belle have evidence for $Z_1(4050)^-$ and $Z_2(4250)^$ states in $B0 \rightarrow Z^-K^+$, $Z^- \rightarrow \chi_{c1}\pi^-$.
- BaBar have not confirmed... Phys. Rev. D 85, 052003
- Also Belle has claimed evidence for Z_b resonances when looking at $b\bar{b}$ spectrum.

LHCb should be able to do something here in future

An enigma... the X(4140)

- $\begin{array}{c} B^{\pm/0} \to X K^{\pm/0} \\ X \to J/\psi \phi \end{array}$
- X(4140) seen by some experiments, not by others in in m(J/ $\psi\Phi$).
- Could be some hybrid state: ccss

Bottomonium spectrum

Helicity formalism

- Helicity (λ) is projection of \mathbf{J} onto \mathbf{p} (lambda = -|J|...+|J|)
- $a \rightarrow bc$

$$|\mathcal{M}|^2 \propto \left| A_{\lambda_b,\lambda_c} d_{\lambda_a,\lambda_b-\lambda_c}^{J_a}(\theta) e^{i(\lambda_a-(\lambda_b-\lambda_c))\phi} \right|^2$$

- A is complex helicity coupling
- d are Wigner d-matrices (see tables in PDG)
- θ is helicity angle
- ϕ is azimuthal angle defined by decay plane
 - Dependence drops out unless studying cascade decay like $a \rightarrow bc$, $b \rightarrow de$

Helicity formalism

- Cascade decays: $a \rightarrow bc$, $b \rightarrow de$
- In this case, need to coherently sum over helicity of intermediate particle...
- ...and sum incoherently over final state particle helicities.

$$|\mathcal{M}|^2 \propto \sum_{\lambda_c} \sum_{\lambda_d} \sum_{\lambda_e} \left| \sum_{\lambda_b} A^a_{\lambda_b,\lambda_c} A^b_{\lambda_d,\lambda_e} \dots \right|^2$$

- For $B^0 \rightarrow \psi(2S)K^+\pi^-$
 - B^0 is spin-0, $\lambda_B = 0$
 - $\psi(2S) \rightarrow \mu^+ \mu^-$ is EM decay, $\Delta \lambda_\mu = \pm 1$

Amplitude analysis of $B^0 \rightarrow J/\Psi \pi^+ \pi^-$

arXiv:1404.5673

References

- PDG review on light scalar mesons
- Amsler et al, Physics reports 389 (2004) 61-117
- Close http://arxiv.org/pdf/hep-ph/0204205v3.pdf
- Polosa et al (Z(4430), tetraquark model) <u>http://arxiv.org/pdf/1405.1551.pdf</u>
- Gell-Mann (Schematic model of baryons and mesons) Physics Letters volume 8, number 3 (1964).
- <u>http://pdg.lbl.gov/2011/reviews/rpp2011-rev-clebsch-gordan-coefs.pdf</u>